

**On the Paper: "Examples in Cone Metric Spaces: A Survey"** *Middle East Journal of Scientific Research*, 11(12):1636-1640, 2014, M. Asadi, H. Soleimani

عن ورقة البحث:

**"Examples in Cone Metric Spaces: A Survey"** *Middle East Journal of Scientific Research*, 11(12):1636-1640, 2014, M. Asadi, H. Soleimani

**Abdallah Hakawati**

عبد الله حكواتي

Department of Mathematics, Faculty of Science, An-Najah National University, Nablus, Palestine

E-mail: aahakawati@najah.edu

Received: (4/3/2015), Accepted: (8/5/2016)

## Abstract

The paper "*Examples in Cone Metric Spaces: A Survey*" had overlooked the fact that  $\ell^p$ -spaces are Banach spaces only for  $p \geq 1$ . Here, we show that, for  $0 < p < 1$ ,  $\ell^p$  is not even a normed space. We also pointed out that the domain of the function  $\phi$  of Example (1.17) of the paper "*Examples in Cone Metric Spaces: A Survey*" does not allow the cone metric to be defined, so we made two possible alternatives for that to make sense. Furthermore, we give a few remarks on cone metrics and cone norms which were not fully dealt with in the literature.

**Keywords:** Cone Metric Space, Cone Normed Space.

## ملخص

لقد أغفلت الورقة "*Examples in Cone Metric Spaces: A Survey*" حقيقة أن فضاءات  $\ell^p$  هي فضاءات بناخيه فقط عندما تكون  $p \geq 1$ . هنا نثبت أنه عندما تكون

$0 < p < 1$  فإن الفضاء  $\ell^p$  لا يكون فضاءً معيارياً. كما أن مجال الاقتران  $\phi$  في المثال رقم (1.17) من الورقة لا يسمح بتعريف القياس. وهنا أعطينا خيارين لتصويب التعريف. وختاماً كان لنا على القياسات المخروطية والمعايير المخروطية ملاحظات لم يتم تناولها بشكل واضح في الماضي.

**الكلمات المفتاحية:** فضاء قياسي مخروطي، فضاء معياري مخروطي.

## 1. Introduction and Preliminaries

Cone metric spaces were introduced in (Huang, & Hang, 2007. 1468-1476) by means of partially ordering real-Banach spaces by specified cones. In (Abdeljawad, Turkoglo, & Abuloha, 2010. 739-753) and (Turkoglo, Abuloha, & Abdeljawad, 2012), the notion of cone – normed spaces was introduced. Cone – metric spaces, and hence, cone-normed spaces were shown to be first countable topological spaces. The reader may consult (Turkoglo, & Abuloha, 2010. 489-496) for this development.

In (Asadi, Vaezpour, & Soleimani, 2011. 1102. 2353), it was shown that, in a sense, cone –metric spaces are not, really, generalizations of metric spaces. This was the motive to do further investigations. Now we put things in order.

**Definition1.1:** from (Huang, & Hang, (2007). 1468-1476): Let  $(E, \|\cdot\|)$  be a real Banach space and  $P$  a subset of  $E$ . Then  $P$  is called a *cone* if:

- (a)  $P$  is closed , convex, nonempty , and  $P \neq \{0\}$
- (b)  $a, b \in R; a, b \geq 0; x, y \in P \Rightarrow ax + by \in P$
- (c)  $x \in P \text{ and } -x \in P \Rightarrow x = 0$

**Example 1.2:** from (Rezapour, 2007. 85-88): Let  $E = \ell^1$ , the absolutely summable real sequences. Then the set  $P = \{x \in E : x_n \geq 0 \forall n\}$  is a cone in  $E$ .

For a cone  $P \subset E$ , we define (on  $E$ ) a *partial order* with respect to  $P$  as:

$x \leq y$  if  $y - x \in P$ . We write  $x < y$  to indicate that  $x \leq y$  but  $x \neq y$ , and  $x \ll y$  for  $y - x \in P^\circ$  (the interior of  $P$ ). The cone  $P$  is called *normal* if there is a positive number  $K$  such that: For  $x, y \in E$ , if  $0 \leq x \leq y$  then  $\|x\| \leq k\|y\|$ . The smallest such  $k$  is called the *normal constant* of  $P$ .  $P$  is called *strongly minihedral* if every subset of  $E$  which is bounded above has a supremum. Throughout, we will assume that  $P$  is a strongly minihedral normal cone with respect to a real Banach space  $(E, \|\cdot\|)$ . It therefore follows that every subset of  $P$  has an infimum (Abdeljawad, Turkoglo, & Abuloha, 2010. 739-753).

## 2. Cone Normed Spaces

**Definition 2.1:** Suppose that  $P$  is a cone in a normed space  $(E, \|\cdot\|)$ , and let  $X$  be a nonempty set. The pair  $(X, \|\cdot\|_c)$  is called a *cone-normed space* relative to the cone  $P$  if  $\|\cdot\|_c : X \rightarrow E$  is a function that satisfies:

- (a)  $0 \leq \|x\|_c \forall x \in X$ , and equality holds if and only if  $x = 0$ .
- (b)  $\|ax\|_c = |a|\|x\|_c \forall a \in R$  and  $x \in X$ .
- (c)  $\|x + y\|_c \leq \|x\|_c + \|y\|_c \forall x$  and  $y \in Y$ .

It should be noted that: letting  $D(x, y) = \|x - y\|_c$  defines a cone metric on the set  $X$ , but not conversely.

For a rigorous development of cone metric spaces, we refer the reader to (Huang, & Hang, 2007. 1468-1476). We construct the following example to show that cone metrics do not necessarily produce cone norms.

**Example 2.2:** Let  $X = \ell^1$ ,  $P = [0, \infty)$ , and let  $E = \mathbb{R}$ . For  $x, y \in X$ , define

$$d(x, y) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} |x_n - y_n|, \text{ then let } D(x, y) = \frac{d(x, y)}{1 + d(x, y)}.$$

It is easy to check that  $D$  is a cone metric relative to the cone  $P$  which is not compatible with any cone norm.

### 3. $\ell^p$ - SPACES

Recall that for  $p > 0$ , the space  $\ell^p$  is defined as the set of all  $p$ -summable sequences. For  $p \geq 1$ , the space  $\ell^p$  is a Banach space under the norm  $\|x\|_p = \left( \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} |x_n|^p \right)^{\frac{1}{p}}$ .

**Example 3.1:** (for  $0 < p < 1$ ,  $\|x\|_p$  is not a norm):

Take  $x = (1, 0, 0, \dots)$  and  $y = (0, 1, 0, \dots)$ . Then  $\|x + y\|_p = (1^p + 1^p)^{\frac{1}{p}} > 2$ , while  $\|x\|_p + \|y\|_p = 1 + 1 = 2$ .

So, the triangle inequality for norms fails to hold.

Thus, Example (1.18) of (Asadi, Hossein, 2012. 1636-1640), should state:

**Example 3.2:** Let  $p \geq 1$ ,  $E = \ell^p$ , and let  $P = \{x : x_n \geq 0\}$ .  $P$  is a normal cone with normal constant 1, (Asadi, & Hossein, 2012. 1636-1640). For any metric space  $(X, d)$ , define  $d : X \times X \rightarrow E$  as:

$$d(x, y) = \left( \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \left( \frac{d(x, y)}{2^n} \right)^{\frac{1}{p}} \right)^p. \text{ Then } (X, d) \text{ is a cone metric space, (Asadi,}$$

& Hossein, 2012. 1636-1640).

#### 4. EXAMPLE (1.16) of (A sadi, & Hossein, 2012. 1636-1640)

In this quick section we make a generalization of the example.

To be specific, the following is found in (Asadi, Hossein, 2012. 1636-1640).

**Example 4.1:** Let

$$E = R^n, P = \{(x_1, x_2, \dots, x_n) : x_i \geq 0 \forall i = 1, 2, \dots, n\}, X = R,$$

and let  $d : X \times X \rightarrow E$  be defined as:

$$d(x, y) = (|x_1 - y_1|, a_1|x_2 - y_2|, a_2|x_3 - y_3|, \dots, a_{n-1}|x_n - y_n|,$$

where  $a_i \geq 0 \forall 1 \leq i \leq n-1$ . Then  $(X, d)$  is a *cone metric space*.

It is a routine check to see that the following example is a generalization to the foregoing:

**Example 4.2:**

$$\text{Let } E = R^n, P = \{(x_1, x_2, \dots, x_n) : x_i \geq 0, \forall i = 1, 2, \dots\}.$$

Let  $X=R$ , and let  $d: X \times X \rightarrow E$  be defined as:

$$d(x, y) = (a_1|x_1 - y_1|, a_2|x_2 - y_2|, \dots, a_n|x_n - y_n|), \text{ where}$$

$a_i \succ 0, \forall i \ 1 \leq i \leq n$ . Then  $(X, d)$  is a *cone metric space*.

#### 5. EXAMPLE (1.17) of (A sadi, & Hossein, 2012. 1636-1640)

**Remark 5.1:** In Example, (1, 17) of (A sadi, & Hossein, 2012. 1636-1640), The assumption that  $\phi: [0, 1] \rightarrow [0, \infty)$  makes

$d(x, y)$  undefined on the interval  $(1, \infty)$ .

So, a modified statement will now be:

**Example 5.2:** Let  $E = C_R [0, \infty)$ , and  $P = \{f : f(t) \geq 0\}$

Let  $\phi: [0, \infty) \rightarrow [0, \infty)$  be continuous, and  $(X, p)$  be a metric space. Now define

$$d: X \times X \rightarrow E \text{ as: } D(x, y) = p(x, y) \phi.$$

Then  $(X, d)$  is a cone metric space, (A sadi, & Hossein, 2012. 1636-1640).

The following modification also does another choice for modification as well.

**Example 5.3:** Take  $E = \mathbb{C}_R[0, 1]$  and the continuous function

$$\phi: [0, 1] \rightarrow [0, \infty). \text{ Let } (X, \rho) \text{ be a metric space}$$

$$\text{Now define } d: X \times X \rightarrow E \text{ as: } d(x, y) = \rho(x, y)\phi$$

Then  $(X, d)$  is a cone metric space, (A sadi, & Hossein, 2012. 1636-1640).

**Proposition 5.4:**

Consider the cone metric space  $(\mathbb{R}^n, d, P)$ , where  $d$  and  $P$  are as in Example (4.2).

Let  $x = (x_1, x_2, \dots, x_n) \in \mathbb{R}^n$ . Then a sequence  $(x^k)_{k=1}^\infty$  of elements of  $\mathbb{R}^n$  converges to  $x$  if and only if for each  $i=1, 2, \dots, n$ ,  $\lim_{k \rightarrow \infty} x_i^k = x_i$ .

*Proof:*

Let  $\epsilon > 0$  be arbitrary. Choose  $k_0 \in \mathbb{N}$  such that:  
 $k \geq k_0 \Rightarrow d(x^k, x) < (a_1 \in, a_2 \in, \dots, a_n \in)$

Thus, for  $k \geq k_0$ , and for  $i = 1, 2, \dots, n$ , One has :

$$a_i \in -a_i |x_i^k - x_i| > 0, \text{ or equivalently, } |x_i^k - x_i| < \epsilon. \text{ Therefore,}$$

$$\forall i = 1, 2, \dots, n, \lim_{k \rightarrow \infty} x_i^k = x_i.$$

Conversely, suppose that  $\forall i = 1, 2, \dots, n, \lim_{k \rightarrow \infty} x_i^k = x_i$

Let  $c = (c_1, c_2, \dots, c_n) \gg 0$  be arbitrary.

$\forall i = 1, 2, \dots, n$ , Choose  $k_i \in N$  such that:  $\forall k \geq k_i, |x_i^k - x_i| < \frac{c_i}{a_i}$

Take  $k_0 = \max\{k_i : i = 1, 2, \dots, n\}$ . It now follows that:  $\forall k \geq k_0$ ,

$$\begin{aligned} d(x^k, x) &= (a_1 |x_1^k - x_1|, a_2 |x_2^k - x_2|, \dots, a_n |x_n^k - x_n|) \\ &<< (c_1, c_2, \dots, c_n) \\ &= c \end{aligned}$$

## 6. FEW REMARKS

We conclude this article with the following remarks.

**Remark 6.1:** (Not every cone metric is induced by a cone norm):

Let  $(E, \|\cdot\|)$  be a Banach space and  $P$  a strongly minihedral cone.

On any subset  $X$  of  $E$ , define the cone metric  $d$  as:  $d(x, y) = \inf\{x - y, x_0\}$  where

$x_0 \neq 0$  is any fixed element of  $X$ . If the metric  $d$  were induced by a cone norm  $\|\cdot\|_c$  then the cone normed space  $(X, \|\cdot\|_c)$  must be bounded. But because for  $x \in X$  and  $\forall a \in R, \|ax\|_c = |a| \|\cdot\|_c$ , the set  $\{ax_0 : a \in R\}$  is bounded, which is a contradiction, since  $a$  can be made arbitrarily large.

**Remark 6.2:** Cones may not be minihedral: Here is an example.

Let  $E = C_R^2[0, 1]$ , equipped with the norm  $\|f\| = \|f\|_\infty + \|f'\|_\infty$ , and let

$p = \{f : f(t) \geq 0 \forall t \in [0, 1]\}$ . This cone is not minihedral because, for instance,

take  $f(t) = \sin t$  and  $g(t) = \cos t$ . Clearly the function defined as:  
 $h(t) = \sup_t \{f(t), g(t)\}$  is not an element in  $E$ , since  $h'\left(\frac{\pi}{4}\right)$  does not exist.

**Remark 6.3:** Cones may be strongly minihedral but not minihedral and here is an example:

Let  $E = R^2$ , and  $P = \{(x, 0) \in R^2 : x \geq 0\}$ .

Let  $A$  be a subset of  $R^2$  which is bounded above, say by  $(a, b)$

By the definition of  $P$ , elements of  $A$  must have the form  $(x, b)$

Where  $x \leq a$ . Now, the set  $X = \{x \in R : (x, b) \in A\}$  is a non – empty set of  $R$ , which is bounded above. Hence has an infimum, call it  $u$ . Now,  $(u, b) = \sup A$ . Thus  $P$  is strongly minihedral. However,  $P$  is not minihedral. To see this, take  $x = (-1, -1)$  and  $y = (-2, -2)$ . If  $(a, b) \geq x$  then  $b = -1$ , and if  $(a, b) \geq y$  then  $b = -2$ , which is a contradiction.

**Remark 6.4:** This is a refinement of Example (1.21) of (Asadi, Hossein, 2012. 1636-1640). By this example, we intend to enforce the fact that norm-convergence is different from cone metric-convergence.

Let  $E = C_R^2[0, 1]$ , equipped with the norm  $\|f\| = \|f\|_\infty + \|f'\|_\infty$ , and let  $P = \{f : f(t) \geq 0 \forall t \in [0, 1]\}$ .

$\forall n \in N$ , take  $x_n(t) = \frac{1 - \sinh(nt)}{n + 2}$ , so  $x_n \in C_R^2[0, 1]$ .

Let  $d : E \times E \rightarrow E$  be defined as:  $d(x, y) = \begin{cases} x + y; & \text{if } x \neq y \\ 0; & \text{if } x = y \end{cases}$ .



It is a direct check that  $d$  is a cone metric. To see that  $x_n \xrightarrow{d} 0$ ,

Let  $c \gg 0$  be arbitrary, so  $c \in P$ , and as a continuous function on the compact set  $[0,1]$ , let  $\delta_0 = \min \{c(t) : t \in [0,1]\}$ .

Since  $c(t) > 0 \forall t \in [0,1]$ ,  $\delta_0 > 0$

By the Archimedean Property, pick  $n_0 \in \mathbb{N}$  such that  $\frac{1}{2+n_0} < \delta_0$ .

Now, for all  $t \in [0,1]$  and all  $n \geq n_0$  we have :

$$\begin{aligned} c(t) - x_n(t) &= c(t) - \frac{1 - \sinh(nt)}{n+2} \\ &\geq \delta_0 - \frac{1}{n+2} + \frac{\sinh(nt)}{n+2} \\ &\geq \delta_0 - \frac{1}{n+2} \\ &> \delta_0 - \frac{1}{n+2} \\ &> 0 \end{aligned}$$

Since  $t$  was arbitrary, it follows that:  $\forall n \geq n_0, c \gg x_n$ , Thus  $x_n \xrightarrow{d} 0$ .

Finally,  $x_n \xrightarrow{\|\cdot\|} 0$ . To see this,

$$\forall n, \text{ we have : } \|x_n\| = \left\| \frac{1 - \sinh(nt)}{n+2} \right\|_{\infty} + \left\| \frac{n \cosh(nt)}{n+2} \right\|_{\infty} \geq \frac{1}{2}$$

**Remark 6.5:** In (Turkoglu, & Abuloha, 2010. 489-496), the notion of *positive cone* was given.

For an example of a cone metric space whose *positive cone* has a non –empty interior, the authors gave  $L^1$  form (Deilimling, K. 1985). Here we give the following example

**Example 6.6:** Let  $E = R^2$ , and take  $P = \{(x,0) : x \geq 0\}$ .

Of course  $P$  is a cone in  $E$  whose positive cone (which is  $P$  itself) has empty interior.

## References

- Huang, L.G. & hang, X, Z. (2007). Cone metric spaces and fixed point theorems of contractive mappings. *J. Math. Anal. Appl.*, 332, 1468-1476
- Rezapour, Sh. (2007). Best approximation in cone metric spaces, *Mathematica Moraveca*, 11. 85-88
- Abdeljawad, T. Turkoglo, D. & Abuloha, M. (2010). Some theorems and examples of cone Banach spaces. *J. Computational Anal. And App.* 12(4). 739-753
- Turkoglo, D. & Abuloha, M. (2010). Cone metric spaces and fixed point theorems in diametrically contractive mappings, *Acta Mathematica. English series*, 26(3). 489-496.
- Asadi, M. Vaezpour, S.M. & Soleimani, H. (2011). Metrizable of cone metric spaces. ar Xiv: 1102. 2353, v1 [math.FA]
- Turkoglo, D. Abuloha, M. & Abdeljawad, T. (2012). Some theorems in cone metric spaces. *Journal of concrete and applicable mathematics*, Vol.10.
- Asadi, M. Hossein Soleimani, (2012). "Examples in Cone Metric Spaces" A Survey" *Middle East Journal of Scientific Research* 11(12). 1636-1640.
- Deilimling, K. (1985). *Nonlinear Functional Analysis*, Springer-Verlag, Berlin.